



Comparable Institutions Proposal

*Utah Valley University
October 24, 2019*

Utah Valley University proposes revising its list of comparable institutions for internal planning and assessment. UVU uses its comparable institutions list to establish internal goals and assess its mission fulfillment and other key plans such as the Completion Plan and Inclusion Plan. UVU also utilizes its list of comparable institutions for IPEDS comparison. Neither the current nor comparable institutions list is used in USHE reported compensation comparisons nor by the National Survey of Student Engagement. This proposal was approved by the UVU Cabinet on September 30, 2019, and is presented for review and approval by the UVU Board of Trustees at its October 24, 2019, meeting.

In addition to internal planning and assessment use, the Utah System of Higher Education (USHE) uses a comparable institutions list for some statistical comparison of institutions within the USHE to other institutions nationally. On October 4, this proposal was submitted for preliminary review by the Office of the Commissioner of Higher Education. Regents Policy R508 requires that OCHE review proposed changes and supporting data prior to approval by the State Board of Regents.

In addition to USHE's use of comparable institutions, beginning in January 2020, NWCCU will utilize a list of comparable institutions as part of its regional accreditation evaluation process.

UVU's current peer institutions list (used internally and by USHE) was developed in 2009, reflecting the university's recent transformation from a state college. As Academic Affairs; Student Affairs; and Planning, Budget, and Human Resources used the list as intended to provide performance comparisons, they have found UVU's current peer institutions list to be increasingly outdated as UVU and its peers have evolved. Several of UVU's current peers have moved explicitly toward research missions; others have become so selective that they no longer provide a useful benchmark on critical indicators of student success. One, Indiana University-Purdue University Fort Wayne, no longer exists. A revised comparison group will provide more appropriate benchmarks for UVU's performance.

UVU proposes its comparison institutions list consist of:

Regional Universities

Weber State University (Current)
Dixie State University
University of Alaska-Anchorage (Current)
Arkansas Tech University

Western Kentucky University
CUNY College of Staten Island

Emerging Dual-Mission Colleges

Palm Beach State College
St Petersburg College

South Texas College
Bellevue College

This proposed list would eliminate eight current peer institutions for the reason listed:

- Boise State University: Carnegie doctoral classification and identifies itself as a research institution
- California State University-Northridge: Does not offer associate degrees; selective admissions with an admissions rate of 57.7%
- Ferris State University: Selective admissions with an admission rate of 74%
- Indiana University-Purdue University Fort Wayne: Institution was dissolved in 2018
- Kennesaw State University: Carnegie doctoral classification
- Metropolitan State University of Denver: Does not offer associate degrees; selective admissions with an admissions rate of 64.3%
- Northern Kentucky University: Western Kentucky University, proposed below, is a better overall fit
- Youngstown State University: Identifies itself as a research institution

METHODOLOGY

This proposal was developed by the Peer Institutions Working Group over the Spring 2019 semester. The group represented Academic Affairs; Student Affairs; and Planning, Budget, and Human Resources. Staff support was provided by Institutional Effectiveness, Planning, and Accreditation Support and Institutional Research.

Stage I: Institutional Universe

Stage I determined the universe of comparable institutions for detailed analysis based on Regents Policy R508, Guidelines for Approving Lists of Comparable Institutions. Analysis used the IPEDS 2017-18 provisional release institutional characteristics data and eliminated any institution that did not meet the following criteria.

- Institutional Type (R508-3.1.1) and Control (R508-3.1.3)
Carnegie Classification: Master's, Baccalaureate, or Baccalaureate/Associate
IPEDS Sector: Public, 4-Year or More
- Size (R508-3.1.2)
IPEDS Institutional Size Category: 10,000 and Above
- Specific Functions (R508-3.2.1)
Not a Land Grant Institution, Historically Black College or University, Tribal College, Senior Military College, online-only institution, or special-focus institution
- Institutional mission statement does not state that it is primarily a research institution.

106 institutions met all conditions to be included in the comparable institutions' universe. Seven institutions were added from outside of this universe for comparability within USHE or to dual-mission institutions with moderate-sized doctoral programs, because they share a similar trajectory to UVU, or because they are current UVU comparison institutions.

Stage II: Ranking

Stage II ranked candidate institutions by similarity to UVU using nearest neighbor analysis. The analysis ranked all institutions in the comparison institutions' universe based on the following factors.

- Open Admission: Open Admissions Policy or Admissions Rate
- Dual Mission: AA/BA Award Ratio
- Primarily Undergraduate: Ratio of Undergraduate to Graduate Enrollment
- Size: Undergraduate Enrollment
- (Sub)Urban: Degree of Urbanization of Metropolitan Statistical Area
- Non-Traditional Students: Adult age (25-64) undergraduate enrollment; PT-FT Ratio
- Multi-modal: Percent of undergraduate students not enrolled in any distance education courses
- Teaching: Grants as % of Revenue
- Socioeconomic Status: Percent of Pell-eligible students

The working group's focus was on factors that reflect institutional characteristics rather than performance to avoid biasing UVU's analysis of its own performance. Data was standardized before ranking.

Stage III: Selection of Proposed Comparable Institutions

Based on the ranking, the working group identified institutions that are appropriate for comparison to UVU. The selection did not strictly apply the rankings; rather the working group sought to include:

- Emerging dual-mission colleges (former community colleges) offering bachelor's degrees and institutions comparable to regional universities within USHE
- Institutions that have mature dual-mission offerings and institutions representing the growing national movement toward dual-mission structures
- Institutions reflecting meaningful geographic diversity while recognizing that some states provide better comparison to UVU than others
- Institutions to which UVU can compare itself on any one specific factor and institutions that provide a broad overall fit

The working group identified 10 institutions that provide a suitable range of comparisons for UVU, including 6 regional universities and 4 emerging dual-mission community colleges. This list was approved by the UVU Cabinet on September 30, 2019.

Data Sources

All data is from the National Center for Education Statistics Integrated Postsecondary Education Data System (IPEDS). The most recent year for which provisional release data is available is used. Additional data is derived from these IPEDS datasets by UVU Institutional Effectiveness, Planning, and Accreditation Support.

PROPOSED COMPARISON INSTITUTION DATA

Carnegie Master's Colleges and Universities

| | Utah Valley University | Weber State University | Arkansas Tech University | College of Staten Island CUNY | University of Alaska Anchorage | Western Kentucky University |
|--|---|----------------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------------|--------------------------------|-----------------------------|
| Institutional Characteristics | | | | | | |
| State | UT | UT | AR | NY | AK | KY |
| Carnegie Classification | Master's Colleges & Universities: Small Programs | Master's Colleges & Universities | | | | |
| | | Larger Programs | Larger Programs | Larger Programs | Larger Programs | Larger Programs |
| Fall Enrollment and Admissions | | | | | | |
| Total Enrollment | 37,282 | 27,949 | 11,830 | 13,594 | 15,733 | 20,257 |
| Undergraduate Enrollment | 36,868 | 27,111 | 10,781 | 12,509 | 14,955 | 17,656 |
| Fall FTE | 26,093 | 18,215 | 8,851 | 11,360 | 10,596 | 16,332 |
| Annualized FTE | 26,721 | 17,216 | 8,945 | 11,222 | 11,228 | 16,273 |
| Admissions Rate | 100% | 100% | 95% | 100% | 83% | 95% |
| Awards | | | | | | |
| Graduate Awards | 2% | 6% | 10% | 10% | 12% | 24% |
| Bachelor's Awards | 59% | 47% | 46% | 62% | 48% | 68% |
| Associate Awards | 36% | 45% | 17% | 28% | 34% | 5% |
| Undergraduate Certificate Awards | 4% | 2% | 26% | 0% | 5% | 4% |
| Completion and Retention | | | | | | |
| Undergraduate Awards (2016-17) per 100 Undergraduate FTE (2013-14) | 21.0 | 30.3 | 29.7 | 20.1 | 18.9 | 21.8 |
| Outcome Measures (8-Year Completion, All Cohorts) | 37% | 42% | 46% | 32% | 31% | 47% |
| GRS150 Graduation Rate (Total Cohort) | 30% | 33% | 39% | 30% | 24% | 43% |

| | Utah Valley University | Weber State University | Arkansas Tech University | College of Staten Island CUNY | University of Alaska Anchorage | Western Kentucky University |
|--|------------------------|------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------------|--------------------------------|-----------------------------|
| GRS150 Graduation Rate (Bachelor's Cohort) | 26% | 33% | 40% | 48% | 25% | 51% |
| First-Year Full-time Retention Rate (GRS Cohort) | 66% | 65% | 72% | 76% | 69% | 70% |
| Student Characteristics | | | | | | |
| Full-Time | 50% | 42% | 58% | 73% | 46% | 68% |
| Minority | 19% | 19% | 21% | 54% | 39% | 18% |
| Adult (25-64) | 25% | 27% | 23% | 23% | 44% | 21% |
| Received Pell | 32% | 23% | 39% | 46% | 22% | 31% |
| Tuition and Fees | | | | | | |
| Published Tuition and Fees | \$5,652 | \$5,712 | \$7,104 | \$7,090 | \$6,690 | \$10,202 |
| Tuition and Fees 5-year Growth | 18% | 20% | 34% | 21% | 17% | 20% |
| Total Price for Resident Living Off Campus | \$15,986 | \$20,364 | \$24,572 | \$27,602 | \$27,591 | \$23,015 |
| Institutional Finance | | | | | | |
| Core Expenses per FTE | \$11,306 | \$12,138 | \$13,250 | \$18,809 | \$26,277 | \$21,319 |
| Core Expenses for Instruction | 46% | 51% | 39% | 55% | 44% | 40% |
| Core Revenues per FTE | \$12,218 | \$14,465 | \$13,345 | \$19,253 | \$24,300 | \$20,281 |
| Core Revenue from Tuition and Fees | 42% | 34% | 33% | 20% | 28% | 42% |
| Core Revenue from Appropriations | 33% | 33% | 30% | 37% | 45% | 22% |
| Core Revenue from Gifts, Grants, and Contracts | 20% | 17% | 33% | 26% | 19% | 18% |
| Endowment Assets per FTE | \$1,133 | \$7,705 | \$3,728 | \$735 | \$4,912 | \$945 |

Carnegie Baccalaureate/Associate’s Colleges and Universities

(UVU included for comparison purposes)

| | Utah Valley University | Dixie State University | Bellevue College | Palm Beach State College | South Texas College | St. Petersburg College |
|--|---|---|--|--------------------------|----------------------|------------------------|
| Institutional Characteristics | | | | | | |
| State | UT | UT | WA | FL | TX | FL |
| Carnegie Classification | Master's Colleges & Universities: Small Programs | Baccalaureate/Associate’s Colleges and Universities | | | | |
| | | Mixed Bach./Assc. | Associate's Dominant | Associate's Dominant | Associate's Dominant | Mixed Bach./Assc. |
| Fall Enrollment and Admissions | | | | | | |
| Total Enrollment | 37,282 | 9,673 | 13,322 | 30,052 | 31,321 | 29,548 |
| Undergraduate Enrollment | 36,868 | 9,673 | 13,322 | 30,052 | 31,321 | 29,548 |
| Fall FTE | 26,093 | 7,514 | 9,467 | 17,080 | 19,074 | 17,091 |
| Annualized FTE | 26,721 | 6,787 | 10,711 | 20,286 | 21,449 | 19,351 |
| Admissions Rate | 100% | 100% | 100% | 100% | 100% | 100% |
| Awards | | | | | | |
| Graduate Awards | 2% | 0% | 0% | 0% | 0% | 0% |
| Bachelor's Awards | 59% | 37% | 5% | 5% | 5% | 15% |
| Associate Awards | 36% | 48% | 80% | 58% | 61% | 65% |
| Undergraduate Certificate Awards | 4% | 15% | 14% | 37% | 34% | 19% |
| Completion and Retention | | | | | | |
| Undergraduate Awards (2016-17) per 100 Undergraduate FTE (2013-14) | 21.0 | 29.5 | 22.9 | 37.3 | 30.2 | 35.2 |
| Outcome Measures (8-Year Completion, All Cohorts) | 37% | 41% | 39% | 39% | 26% | 36% |
| GRS150 Graduation Rate (Total Cohort) | 30% | 34% | 24% | 33% | 15% | 29% |
| GRS150 Graduation Rate (Bachelor's Cohort) | 26% | 20% | No 2011 Bachelor's Degree-Seeking Cohort | | | |

| | Utah Valley University | Dixie State University | Bellevue College | Palm Beach State College | South Texas College | St. Petersburg College |
|--|------------------------|------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|---------------------|--------------------------|
| First-Year Full-time Retention Rate (GRS Cohort) | 66% | 56% | No Bach. Entering Cohort | No Bach. Entering Cohort | 70% | No Bach. Entering Cohort |
| Student Characteristics | | | | | | |
| Full-Time | 50% | 63% | 51% | 28% | 34% | 29% |
| Minority | 19% | 22% | 47% | 64% | 98% | 36% |
| Adult (25-64) | 25% | 17% | 31% | 30% | 9% | 47% |
| Received Pell | 32% | 37% | 12% | 37% | 38% | 39% |
| Tuition and Fees | | | | | | |
| Published Tuition and Fees | \$5,652 | \$5,080 | \$3,699 | \$2,444 | \$4,020 | \$3,352 |
| Tuition and Fees 5-year Growth | 18% | 24% | -2% | 3% | -33% | 6% |
| Total Price for Resident Living Off Campus | \$15,986 | \$20,736 | \$18,249 | \$16,244 | \$12,448 | \$19,539 |
| Institutional Finance | | | | | | |
| Core Expenses per FTE | \$11,306 | \$14,621 | \$10,420 | \$8,876 | \$8,531 | \$11,051 |
| Core Expenses for Instruction | 46% | 27% | 52% | 44% | 47% | 42% |
| Core Revenues per FTE | \$12,218 | \$14,466 | \$11,344 | \$9,066 | \$9,760 | \$11,016 |
| Core Revenue from Tuition and Fees | 42% | 39% | 45% | 21% | 11% | 19% |
| Core Revenue from Appropriations | 33% | 37% | 28% | 34% | 53% | 34% |
| Core Revenue from Gifts, Grants, and Contracts | 20% | 18% | 22% | 33% | 35% | 31% |
| Endowment Assets per FTE | \$1,133 | \$2,249 | \$597 | \$924 | \$16 | \$1,392 |

Institutional Averages

| | Utah Valley University | All Comparison Institutions Average | Master's Colleges & Universities Average | Baccalaureate/ Associate's Colleges Average |
|--|------------------------|-------------------------------------|--|---|
| Fall Enrollment and Admissions | | | | |
| Total Enrollment | 37,282 | 20,328 | 17,873 | 22,783 |
| Undergraduate Enrollment | 36,868 | 19,693 | 16,602 | 22,783 |
| Fall FTE | 26,093 | 13,558 | 13,071 | 14,045 |
| Annualized FTE | 26,721 | 14,347 | 12,977 | 15,717 |
| Admissions Rate | 100% | 97% | 95% | 100% |
| Awards | | | | |
| Graduate Awards | 2% | 6% | 12% | 0% |
| Bachelor's Awards | 59% | 34% | 54% | 14% |
| Associate Awards | 36% | 44% | 26% | 62% |
| Undergraduate Certificate Awards | 4% | 16% | 7% | 24% |
| Completion and Retention | | | | |
| Undergraduate Awards (2016-17) per 100 Undergraduate FTE (2013-14) | 21.0 | 27.6 | 24.1 | 31.0 |
| Outcome Measures (8-Year Completion, All Cohorts) | 37% | 38% | 40% | 36% |
| GRS150 Graduation Rate (Total Cohort) | 30% | 30% | 34% | 27% |
| GRS150 Graduation Rate (Bachelor's Cohort) | 26% | 36% | 39% | N/A |
| First-Year Full-time Retention Rate (GRS Cohort) | 66% | 68% | 70% | N/A |
| Student Characteristics | | | | |
| Full-Time | 50% | 49% | 57% | 41% |
| Minority | 19% | 42% | 30% | 53% |
| Adult (25-64) | 25% | 27% | 28% | 27% |
| Received Pell | 32% | 32% | 32% | 33% |
| Tuition and Fees | | | | |
| Published Tuition and Fees | \$5,652 | \$5,539 | \$7,360 | \$3,719 |
| Tuition and Fees 5-year Growth | 18% | 11% | 22% | -1% |

| | Utah Valley University | All Comparison Institutions Average | Master's Colleges & Universities Average | Baccalaureate/ Associate's Colleges Average |
|--|------------------------|-------------------------------------|--|---|
| Total Price for Resident Living Off Campus | \$15,986 | \$21,036 | \$24,629 | \$17,443 |
| Institutional Finance | | | | |
| Core Expenses per FTE | \$11,306 | \$14,529 | \$18,359 | \$10,700 |
| Core Expenses for Instruction | 46% | 44% | 46% | 42% |
| Core Revenues per FTE | \$12,218 | \$14,730 | \$18,329 | \$11,130 |
| Core Revenue from Tuition and Fees | 42% | 29% | 31% | 27% |
| Core Revenue from Appropriations | 33% | 35% | 33% | 37% |
| Core Revenue from Gifts, Grants, and Contracts | 20% | 25% | 23% | 28% |
| Endowment Assets per FTE | \$1,133 | \$2,320 | \$3,605 | \$1,036 |